

WILD AND SCENIC ELIGIBILITY ANALYSIS FOR ARCHAEOLOGY
San Juan Forest and BLM

Draft 5/3/06

I. Region of comparison:

“The interdisciplinary team must identify the area of consideration that will serve as the basis for meaningful comparative analysis. This area of consideration is not fixed; it may be a national forest, grassland, prairie, or comparable administrative unit, a portion of a state, or an appropriately scaled physiographic or hydrologic unit. Once the area of consideration is identified, a river’s values can then be analyzed in comparison with other rivers.” (FSH 1909.12-80)

For this resource, we used the following area of consideration.

SW Colorado

Southern Rocky Mountains Province

Colorado Plateau Province

other (explain) The region of comparison for prehistoric sites will be within the Colorado Plateau. Historic sites will be within the Southwest Colorado and/or the Four-Corners region. A formal determination of eligibility or listing of a site on the NRHP is made on the basis of National significance

II. Analysis procedure

“There are a variety of methods to determine that certain river-related values are so unique, rare, or exemplary as to make them outstandingly remarkable. The determination that a river area contains outstanding values is a professional judgment on the part of an interdisciplinary team, based on objective, scientific analysis.” (FSH 1909.12-80)

In order to be assessed as outstandingly remarkable, a river-related value must be a unique, rare, or exemplary feature that is significant at a comparative regional or national scale. A river-related value would be a conspicuous example of that value from among a number of similar examples that are themselves uncommon or extraordinary. (FSH 1909.12-80)

The following eligibility criteria are offered to foster greater consistency within the agency and with other federal river-administering agencies. They are intended to set minimum thresholds to establish outstandingly remarkable values and are illustrative and not all-inclusive. These criteria may be modified to make them more meaningful in the area of comparison, and additional criteria may be included.

Historic and Cultural. The river, or area within the river corridor, contains important evidence of occupation or use by humans. Sites may have national or regional importance for interpreting history or prehistory.

a. *History.* Site(s) or feature(s) associated with a significant event, an important person, or a cultural activity of the past that was rare or one-of-a-kind in the region. A historic site or feature, in most cases, is 50 years old or older.

b. *Pre-history.* Sites may have unique or rare characteristics or exceptional human interest value; represent an area where a culture or cultural period was first identified and described; may have been used concurrently by two or more cultural groups; or may have been used by cultural groups for rare sacred purposes. (FSH 1909.12-80)

(describe analysis procedure here, including data available, references consulted, etc.)

Document attached below **Procedures and Rationale for Wild and Scenic Rivers Analysis**

III. Justification for each ORV

Document attached below **Procedures and Rationale for Wild and Scenic Rivers Analysis**

The attached document describes the rationale used to select river related cultural resource sites that are outstandingly remarkable. The attached table lists each stream segment and its applicable site numbers (or summary)

San Juan Public Lands Cultural and Heritage Procedures and Rationale for Wild and Scenic Rivers Analysis

The purpose of this summary is to document the methods used for identification of cultural resources, the evaluation process and rationale used to determine if these resources embody unique, rare, or exemplary characteristics that would qualify them as “outstandingly remarkable values” for the San Juan Public Lands Wild and Scenic River Analysis. Because of the proximity to and similarity of cultural resources managed by the San Juan Public Lands, these procedures and rationale were adapted from those developed for the Wild and Scenic Rivers planning process for the Canyon of the Ancients National Monument, developed by Laura Kochanski, Archaeologist, Canyons of the Ancients National Monument.

Analysis for Eligibility and Classification

The eligibility analysis consists of an examination of the river's hydrology, including any man-made alterations, and an inventory of its natural, cultural, and recreational resources.

The analysis to determine the presence of cultural resources, for both the San Juan Public Lands (Bureau of Land Management (BLM) and Forest Service (FS)) was done using existing data from the archaeological site and survey maps, the SHPO site data base-COMPASS, and the SJNF GIS database.

The area encompassed by the analysis is a 0.5 mi. corridor (0.25 mi. on either side of the stream).

Cultural resources are defined in this analysis as including prehistoric and historic sites. Protohistoric and historic Native American sites are included with historic sites. This is consistent with the suggested "outstandingly remarkable values" of "Prehistory" and "History" (Diedrich and Thomas 1999).

The analysis will consider only cultural resources classified as sites.

National Register eligibility and listing status was determined using the Colorado State Historic Preservation Office COMPASS site database. The significance of National Register eligibility, as described at the National Register of Historic Places web site, is:

"The National Register of Historic Places is the Nation's official list of cultural resources worthy of preservation. Authorized under the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966, the National Register is part of a national program to coordinate and support public and private efforts to identify, evaluate, and protect our historic and archeological resources. Properties listed in the Register include districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that are significant in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture.

National Register properties are distinguished by having been documented and evaluated according to uniform standards. These criteria recognize the accomplishments of all peoples who have contributed to the history and heritage of the United States and are designed to help state and local governments, Federal agencies, and others identify important historic and archeological properties worthy of preservation and of consideration in planning and development decisions.

Criteria for Evaluation

The quality of significance in American history, architecture, archeology, engineering, and culture is present in districts, sites, buildings, structures, and objects that possess integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association, and:

- A.** That are associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history; or
- B.** That are associated with the lives of persons significant in our past; or

- C. That embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction, or that represent the work of a master, or that possess high artistic values, or that represent a significant and distinguishable entity whose components may lack individual distinction; or
- D. That have yielded or may be likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.”

Analyses methods and the specifics of the existing data are contained in the descriptions for each agency below.

BLM

The shape files of the streams to be considered for Wild and Scenic River designation were overlaid onto a small scale map of the USGS topographic quadrangles, stream segments were labeled.

A manual review of the Field Office base archaeological maps (site and inventory) was conducted for each stream segment within the 0.5 mi. corridor. The site number was noted for each site within the corridor. The SHPO site database was checked to determine the National Register eligibility status for each site. Only sites that are listed on the NRHP, or have been formally determined eligible were entered on the spreadsheet for further consideration in the analysis process as a potential ORV. Additional information sources include site forms, reports, and other related site documentation in the Field Office records, and the SHPO site database.

FS

The San Juan NF GIS database was used as the primary tool for the initial identification of streams that contained NRHP eligible or listed sites. This database was developed using the site and survey data collected since the formal inception of the Heritage Program on the Forest in 1978, and data obtained from the Colorado State Historic Preservation Office records. Other records that were consulted include site forms, reports, related site documentation, and “An Overview of the Archaeological Resources in the San Juan-Rio Grande National Forest: Mancos-Dolores, Columbine, and Pagosa Rangers Districts” (Duke et al 1998).

The initial eligibility screen identified river segments coincident with NRHP eligible or listed sites that are within the 0.5 mi. wide corridor. A spreadsheet and map were produced that listed and contained only these coincident streams. A second map was prepared that showed the location of the stream segments and the sites, with an accompanying table listing the site numbers for NRHP listed or eligible sites in each segment.

Definition of River Related Resources

For the purpose of this analysis, all cultural resources located within 0.25 mile from either side of the stream are considered river related resources.

Region of Comparison

The region of comparison for prehistoric sites will be within the Colorado Plateau. Historic sites will be within the Southwest Colorado and/or the Four-Corners region. A formal determination of eligibility or listing of a site on the NRHP is made on the basis of National significance.

Determining Which Sites are “Outstanding Remarkable Values”

For the purposes of this analysis, any prehistoric or historic site that is listed on or formally determined eligible for the National Register of Historic Places will be considered a potential ORV. Since the analysis will be conducted using existing data, and the CO SHPO COMPASS database will be used to determine the NRHP eligibility status, sites that are not in the SHPO database, or that are unevaluated, or need additional data to evaluate will not be considered.

Criteria for Determining Stream Eligibility Based Upon Cultural Resources

The stream contains one or more sites that are listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

The stream contains one or more sites that have been determined eligible for the National Register of Historic Places in consultation with the Colorado State Historic Preservation Officer, or in compliance with the BLM Colorado Protocol. (Note: on later review, places where logging railroad grades and the Animas/Silverton wagon road crossed streams were not “water related values”, and were dropped from the list of ORVs. we decided to exclude lithic scatters (which most likely represent seasonal camp sites) as ORV's because we felt that their locations were not as directly water related as more permanent type habitation sites, or other site types like mining)

The stream is included entirely or partially within an existing National Register District.

The stream is known, based on existing data, to contain a grouping of sites that have National Register District potential.

The stream has one or more sites that are listed as National Historic Landmarks.

Additional Explanatory Notes:

Piedra River – West Rim (Peterson Mesa). The sites located on top of the mesa and escarpment are considered topographically separated from the river corridor because of the landform, and are not considered “river related.”

Piedra River – East Side. The topography of the East side of the river is more gradual and does not effectively isolate the cultural resources from the river, and cultural resources in this situation are considered “river related.”

The only exception to using “officially eligible” determinations contained in the CO SHPO COMPASS database, were three sites along the lower reaches of the Piedra River, in the vicinity of Chimney Rock on the East side of the river. This exception was made due to the poor quality of the archaeological data, (i.e. sites not submitted to SHPO and entered into COMPASS). Their inclusion as ORV’s is made based upon the professional knowledge of the agency archaeologists about the significance of these sites and their potential to yield important information about the prehistory of this Northeastern-most extent of the prehistoric ancestral puebloans.

/s/ Linda Farnsworth Date 2/10/2005

Summary table of stream segments and cultural resource sites.

HUC4	HUC NAME	STREAM_NM	archy
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Beaver Creek	10 sites-points, 6 sites-poygons, 5DL1216 B.Cr. Massacre Site-listed NRHP
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Boggy Draw	37 sites-points, 21 sites-polygons
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Bull Canyon	5MN4678-historic. 5SM1100 and 5SM73-prehistoric
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Dolores River (McPhee Dam to Taylor)	134 sites-points, 1 site-linear, 48 sites-polygons-ANASAZI ARCH NR DISTRICT
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Dolores River, above Taylor	5MT13043, 5MT4035,13489, Railroads &bridge
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Dolores River, Big Gypsum to La Sal Cr	5MN2930-prehistoric rock art, 5mn72
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Dolores River, La Sal Cr to Bedrock	5MN439, 5MN2772-prehistoric rock art, important archy
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Dolores River, Mcphee Res to Disappointment	5MT5071
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Dolores River, Disappointment to Big Gypsum	5SM404-prehistoric artifact scatter
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Dry Canyon	5MT2240,4783,4789,4791,4797,6702,4018,5087,6872,6874,6876
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Ferris Canyon	5DL2359
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Five Pine Canyon (Doe Canyon)	5DL790
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Leach Creek	5MN2930-prehistoric rock art
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Long Draw (Long Draw)	5DL1231,1286,476,468,687,1228,1230

14030002	Upper Dolores River	Long Draw (trib to Beaver)	5DL1765
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Lost Canyon	5MT4587,8639,9176,9182, 4035, NAT REG DISTRICT
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Mavreeso Creek	5DL1024-1026,1028
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Nicholas Wash	5SM2378-lithic scatter, 5SM2379-lithic and rock shelter
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Rock Spring Creek	5MT10464
14030002	Upper Dolores River	Spruce Water Canyon	5MT11442,11439
14030002	Upper Dolores River	West Dolores River (includes Lizardhead Wilderness)	5DL896,1176,8041,885
14080102	Piedra River	Devil Creek	5AA103-105, 1479, 1518
14080102	Piedra River	Piedra River	5AA2437-2438-Upper/5AA981E side lower, 5AA1076W side lower-sites on E. side Piedra, Chimney Rock related-see rationale
14080102	Piedra River	Williams Creek	5HN1, archaic campsite
14080107	Mancos River	West Mancos River	5MT12093
14080104	Animas River	Animas River, Deer Park to Animas Forks	LOTS of mining, millimg,roads, railroads, etc
14080104	Animas River	Animas River, Deer Park to Bakers Bridge	Tacoma/Shenandoah-Dives Mill Powerline, train 5LP302 (NHL)
14080104	Animas River	Cement Creek	Fairview Townsite , Historic Mining Sites, etc
14080104	Animas River	South Fork Animas River	5SA25 Eureka Townsite
14080104	Animas River	West Fork Animas River California Gulch	5SA349 Sound Democrat Mill
14080101	Upper San Juan River	Burns Canyon	5AA593
14080101	Upper San Juan River	East Fork San Juan River	5ML15Z
14080101	Upper San Juan River	Los Pinos, above Vallecito Reservoir	Granit Peak Guard Station 5HN208
14080101	Upper San Juan River	Sauls Creek	Spring Creek NRD, 7 sites
14080101	Upper San Juan River	Spring Creek	Spring Creek NRD, 12 sites